

NEW YORK STATE COMMISSION ON JUDICIAL CONDUCT

ROBERT H. TEMBECKJIAN ADMINISTRATOR & COUNSEL

61 BROADWAY, SUITE 1200 NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10006 MARISA E. HARRISON PUBLIC INFORMATION OFFICER

646-386-4800 646-458-0037 TELEPHONE FACSIMILE www.cjc.ny.gov

NEWS RELEASE

January 11, 2024

Contact:

Marisa E. Harrison, Public Information Officer (518) 453-4600

Broome County Town Justice Should Be Removed for Inappropriate Sexual Comments and Other Serious Misconduct

The New York State Commission on Judicial Conduct has determined that Randy A. Hall, a Justice of the Dickinson Town Court, Broome County, should be removed from office for sexually harassing his co-judge and court staff, asserting his judicial office with police officers during a dispute, conveying the impression that he had prejudged the guilt of criminal defendants and posting sexual and otherwise inappropriate content to his public Facebook page.

The Commission found that Judge Hall:

- Made crude, sexually charged and otherwise inappropriate comments to and about his co-judge and court clerks, including references to sexual intercourse with a pig, his female co-judge's undergarments, the humming sound of a vibrator, and an intimate picture of a woman on his cellphone;
- Made mocking references to mandatory sexual harassment awareness and training programs;
- Repeatedly identified himself as a judge during a petty dispute at gas station;
- Conveyed to various defendants the appearance that he had prejudged their guilt; and

• Joked on his public Facebook page about a serial killer, about a jury that was not hung but a judge who "sure" was, and about someone "peeking" up his judicial robe.

In its removal decision, the Commission said:

[Judge Hall] violated the Rules when he made inappropriate sexually charged comments to his co-judge and court staff; while on the record, he publicly inquired about employment with the police department which suggested bias in favor of law enforcement; he invoked his judicial office in connection with a personal matter and made comments which gave at least the impression that he had prejudged the guilt of three criminal defendants appearing before him. He also detracted from the dignity of judicial office when he made sexual comments on his public Facebook page, some of which referenced his judicial position.

The Commission also found that the judge's decision to ignore the Commission's proceedings "aggravated his underlying misconduct."

Judge Hall, who is not an attorney, has served as a Justice of the Dickinson Town Court since 2022. His current term expires on December 31, 2025.

Statement by Commission Administrator

Commission Administrator Robert H. Tembeckjian made the following statement.

"There is no place on the bench for a judge who denigrates women, makes crude salacious jokes, mocks sexual harassment awareness training, and seems to have no idea why public confidence in the courts would be undermined when a judge says or does such things. That Judge Hall did not participate in the Commission's proceedings underscores his utter disregard for the ethical obligations of a judge."

The Commission Proceedings

Judge Hall was served with a Formal Written Complaint dated March 15, 2023, containing four charges. He did not file an Answer.

By motion dated June 1, 2023, the Administrator moved for summary determination. The judge did not submit a response. The motion was granted on July 20, 2023, determining that the factual allegations of the Complaint were sustained and that the judge's misconduct was established.

Counsel to the Commission filed a brief arguing for the judge's removal and waived oral argument unless the judge was to appear. The judge did not make a submission on the issue of sanction, respond to the administrator's brief or appear for oral argument.

The Commission Determination

The Commission filed a determination dated October 17, 2023, in which 10 members concurred: Joseph W. Belluck, Esq. (the Commission Chair), Taa Grays, Esq., (the Vice Chair), Hon. Fernando M. Camacho, Judge John A. Falk, Judge Robert J. Miller, Nina M. Moore, Marvin Ray Raskin, Esq., Graham B. Seiter, Esq., and Akosua Garcia Yeboah.

One member, Ronald J. Rosenberg, Esq., did not participate.

Court of Appeals Review

The Commission transmitted its determination to the Chief Judge of the Court of Appeals, pursuant to Judiciary Law Section 44, subdivision 7. Judge Hall received it on January 10, 2024, and the Commission was subsequently notified by the Court of Appeals that service was complete. Consequently, the matter is now public.

A judge may either accept the Commission's determination or, within 30 days from receipt, make a written request to the Chief Judge for a review of the determination by the Court of Appeals.

Pursuant to Judiciary Law Section 44, subdivision 7, if Judge Hall does not request review by the Court of Appeals, the Court of Appeals will remove him in accordance with the determination.

If a Commission determination is reviewed by the Court of Appeals, the Court may accept the determined sanction, impose a different sanction including admonition, censure or removal, or impose no sanction.

Statistics Relating to Prior Determinations

Since 1978, the Commission has issued 182 determinations of removal against judges in New York State. The Commission has issued 349 determinations of censure and 283 determinations of admonition.

The Court of Appeals has reviewed 102 Commission determinations. The Court accepted the Commission's sanctions in 86 cases (77 of which were removals, six

were censures and three were admonitions). Of the remaining 16 cases, two sanctions were increased from censure to removal, and 13 were reduced: nine removal determinations were modified to censure, one removal was modified to admonition, two censures were modified to admonition, and one censure was rejected and the charges dismissed. The Court remitted one matter to the Commission for further proceedings.

Counsel

In the proceedings before the Commission, Judge Hall represented himself.

The Commission was represented by Deputy Administrator Cathleen S. Cenci, Senior Attorney Kathleen E. Klein and Senior Investigator Laura Misjak.

Background Information on Judge Hall

First Took Office: 2022

Current Term Expires: December 31, 2025

Members of the Commission

The Commission members serve four-year terms. A list of members is appended.

The Public File

The determination and other records are available on the Commission's website: www.cjc.ny.gov.

MEMBERS OF THE STATE COMMISSION ON JUDICIAL CONDUCT

Member	Appointing Authority	Term End
Joseph W. Belluck, Esq., Chair	Former Governor Andrew M. Cuomo	March 31, 2024
Taa Grays, Esq., Vice Chair	Senate President Pro Tem Andrea Stewart-Cousins	March 31, 2027
Hon. Fernando M. Camacho	Former Chief Judge Janet DiFiore	March 31, 2024
Brian C. Doyle, Esq. ¹	Senate Minority Leader Robert G. Ortt	March 31, 2024
Hon. John A. Falk	Former Chief Judge Janet DiFiore	March 31, 2025
Hon. Robert J. Miller	Governor Kathy Hochul	March 31, 2026
Nina M. Moore	Governor Kathy Hochul	March 31, 2027
Marvin Ray Raskin, Esq.	Assembly Speaker Carl E. Heastie	March 31, 2026
Graham B. Seiter, Esq.	Assembly Minority Leader William A. Barclay	March 31, 2025
Hon. Anil C. Singh	Chief Judge Rowan Wilson	March 31, 2026
Akosua Garcia Yeboah	Former Governor Andrew M. Cuomo	March 31, 2025

¹ The vote in this matter was taken on September 7, 2023. Mr. Doyle, who succeeded Ronald Rosenberg, Esq., and whose term on the Commission commenced on November 20, 2023, did not participate in this matter.